



Friday, September 13, 2024

Notice of Proposal Action

Solicitation Number: 24-51 ST

Solicitation Title: Compensation Study

Solicitation Type: Request for Proposal-RFP


Protest Deadline: Wednesday, September 18, 2024 at 4:00 p.m.

The Purchasing Division received response(s) for the above solicitation on:

Friday, August 9, 2024 at 10:30 AM

At the solicitation opening all submissions were recorded. It is the City of Sarasota's intent to award a contract for this solicitation to the following vendor(s).

The Archer Company

DocuSigned by:

Jennifer Jorgensen
Director, Governmental Relations

13 September 2024

Date

A bidder may file a Notice of Protest by emailing or faxing said Notice to the City of Sarasota Purchasing General Manager within 3 business days of the issuance of the Notice of Bid/Proposal Action. Such Notice of Protest shall include the bid or proposal number and title; the name and address of the protestor; and a brief statement as to the basis of the protest. The complete written protest must be filed with the Purchasing General Manager within 10 calendar days of the issuance of the Notice of Bid/Proposal Action. Please reference City of Sarasota Ordinance 12-5009 for details and layout of response.

Final Scoring Report Package

Member Number	Vendor Number	Cat1	Cat2	Cat3	Cat4	Cat5	Points	Rank
Member 1	Vendor 1	15	20	5	13	20	73	2
	Vendor 2	14	15	4	13	9.14	55.14	5
	Vendor 3	19	25	10	20	8.99	82.99	1
	Vendor 4	12	15	4	15	7.69	53.69	6
	Vendor 5	15	15	8	13	6.08	57.08	4
	Vendor 6	20	15	8	15	5	63	3
Member Number	Vendor Number	Cat1	Cat2	Cat3	Cat4	Cat5	Points	Rank
Member 2	Vendor 1	20	30	8	18	20	96	1
	Vendor 2	12	25	9	16	9.14	71.14	3
	Vendor 3	16	25	10	20	8.99	79.99	2
	Vendor 4	10	20	6	16	7.69	59.69	5
	Vendor 5	16	20	5	12	6.08	59.08	6
	Vendor 6	12	25	5	16	5	63	4
Member Number	Vendor Number	Cat1	Cat2	Cat3	Cat4	Cat5	Points	Rank
Member 3	Vendor 1	15	17	10	15	20	77	4
	Vendor 2	20	30	8	20	9.14	87.14	2
	Vendor 3	20	30	10	20	8.99	88.99	1
	Vendor 4	17	30	9	15	7.69	78.69	3
	Vendor 5	17	30	9	10	6.08	72.08	5
	Vendor 6	17	20	9	10	5	61	6
Member Number	Vendor Number	Cat1	Cat2	Cat3	Cat4	Cat5	Points	Rank
Member 4	Vendor 1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
	Vendor 2	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
	Vendor 3	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
	Vendor 4	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
	Vendor 5	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
	Vendor 6	0	0	0	0	0	0	0

Member Number	Vendor Number	Cat1	Cat2	Cat3	Cat4	Cat5	Points	Rank
Member 5	Vendor 1	20	25	10	20	20	95	1
	Vendor 2	20	30	8	20	9.14	87.14	2
	Vendor 3	20	30	8	20	8.99	86.99	3
	Vendor 4	20	30	8	20	7.69	85.69	4
	Vendor 5	16	15	8	12	6.08	57.08	6
	Vendor 6	16	18	10	18	5	67	5

Committee Member List		
Member 1	Dominique Andersc	
Member 2	Ben Billingsley	
Member 3	Stacie Mason	
Member 4	Deb Muller	Deb Muller was unable to participate in the scoring process
Member 5	Hayden Gaston	

Summary Scoring by Category for RFP #24-51

Evaluation No: Eval1

Vendor Number	Member Number	Total Points:	Ranking
vendor1	member1	73	2
	member2	96	1
	member3	77	4
	member4	0	0
	member5	95	1
Vendor Number	Member Number	Total Points:	Ranking
vendor2	member1	55.14	5
	member2	71.14	3
	member3	87.14	2
	member4	0	0
	member5	87.14	2
Vendor Number	Member Number	Total Points:	Ranking
vendor3	member1	82.99	1
	member2	79.99	2
	member3	88.99	1
	member4	0	0
	member5	86.99	3
Vendor Number	Member Number	Total Points:	Ranking
vendor4	member1	53.69	6
	member2	59.69	5
	member3	78.69	3
	member4	0	0
	member5	85.69	4
Vendor Number	Member Number	Total Points:	Ranking
vendor5	member1	56.08	4
	member2	59.08	6
	member3	72.08	5
	member4	0	0
	member5	57.08	6
Vendor Number	Member Number	Total Points:	Ranking

Summary Scoring by Category for RFP # 24-31

Evaluation No: Eval1

vendor6	member1	63	3
	member2	63	4
	member3	61	6
	member4	0	0
	member5	67	5

Vendor1	Evergreen Associates, LLC
Vendor2	Bolton Partners, Inc.
Vendor3	The Archer Company
Vendor4	MGT of American Consulting, Inc.
Vendor5	Gallagher Benefit Services
Vendor6	CBIZ Compensation Consulting

Vender Number	Total From Rankings	Overall Ranking
vendor3	8	1
vendor1	9	2
vendor2	13	3
vendor4	19	4
vendor6	19	4
vendor5	22	5

Enter by Sign: Samuel Thompson Print Name: Samuel Thompson, NIGP-CPP,

Title: Professional Buyer

Verified by Sign: Jessica Smith Print Name: Jessica Smith, NIGP-CPP, CPPB

City of Sarasota
MEMBER EVALUATION SCORING SHEET

For
24-51ST, Compensation Study
Number of scoring sheets. Sheet 1 of 2

Proposer #1	Evergreen Solutions, LLC
Proposer #2	Bolton Partners, Inc.
Proposer #3	The Archer Company
Proposer #4	MGT of America Consulting, LLC
Proposer #5	Gallagher Benefit Services, Inc.

EVALUATION FACTORS		PROPOSER				
		# 1	# 2	# 3	# 4	# 5
1. Qualifications of Company	20	20	20	20	20	16
2. Personnel	30	25	30	30	30	15
3. Services/References	10	10	8	8	8	8
4. Proposal Requirements	20	20	20	20	22	12
6. Pricing	20	20	9.14	8.99	7.69	6.08
Total Points Scored	100	95	87.14	86.99	85.69	57.08
Ranking		1	2	3	4	6

Committee Member: (print name) Hayden Gaston Initials HG

Signature:  Date: 9/10/24

Summary by:  Date: 9/10/24

Note: This form is to be completed by each member of the selection committee.

Committee Member Number: 5

City of Sarasota
MEMBER EVALUATION SCORING SHEET

For
24-51ST, Compensation Study
Number of Scoring Sheets. Sheet 2 of 2

Proposer #6	CBIZ Compensation Consulting
--------------------	-------------------------------------

EVALUATION FACTORS		PROPOSER				
		# 6	# 7	# 8	#9	#10
1. Qualifications of Company	20	14				
2. Personnel	30	18				
3. Services/References	10	10				
4. Proposal Requirements	20	18				
6. Pricing	20	5				
Total Points Scored	100	67				
Ranking		5				

Committee Member: (print name) Hayden Gaston Initials HB

Signature:  **Date:** 9/10/24

Summary by:  **Date:** 9/10/24

Note: This form is to be completed by each member of the selection committee.

Committee Member Number: 5

City of Sarasota
MEMBER EVALUATION SCORING SHEET

For
24-51ST, Compensation Study
Number of scoring sheets. Sheet 1 of 2

Proposer #1	Evergreen Solutions, LLC
Proposer #2	Bolton Partners, Inc.
Proposer #3	The Archer Company
Proposer #4	MGT of America Consulting, LLC
Proposer #5	Gallagher Benefit Services, Inc.

EVALUATION FACTORS		PROPOSER				
		# 1	# 2	# 3	# 4	# 5
1. Qualifications of Company	20	15	20	20	17	17
2. Personnel	30	17	30	30	30	30
3. Services/References	10	10	8	10	9	9
4. Proposal Requirements	20	15	20	20	15	10
6. Pricing	20	20	9.14	8.99	7.69	6.08
Total Points Scored	100	77	87.14	88.99	78.69	72.08
Ranking						

Committee Member: (print name) Stacie Mason

Initials SM

Signature:  **Date:** 9/10/24

Summary by:  **Date:** 9/10/24

Note: This form is to be completed by each member of the selection committee.

Committee Member Number: 3

City of Sarasota
MEMBER EVALUATION SCORING SHEET

For
24-51ST, Compensation Study
Number of Scoring Sheets. Sheet 2 of 2

Proposer #6	CBIZ Compensation Consulting
--------------------	-------------------------------------

EVALUATION FACTORS		PROPOSER				
		# 6	# 7	# 8	#9	#10
1. Qualifications of Company	20	17				
2. Personnel	30	20				
3. Services/References	10	9				
4. Proposal Requirements	20	10				
6. Pricing	20	5				
Total Points Scored	100	61				
Ranking						

Committee Member: (print name) **Stacie Mason**

Initials **SLM**

Signature:

Date:

Summary by:

Date:

Note: This form is to be completed by each member of the selection committee.

Committee Member Number: 3

City of Sarasota
MEMBER EVALUATION SCORING SHEET

For
24-51ST, Compensation Study
Number of scoring sheets. Sheet 1 of 2

Proposer #1	Evergreen Solutions, LLC
Proposer #2	Bolton Partners, Inc.
Proposer #3	The Archer Company
Proposer #4	MGT of America Consulting, LLC
Proposer #5	Gallagher Benefit Services, Inc.

EVALUATION FACTORS		PROPOSER				
		# 1	# 2	# 3	# 4	# 5
1. Qualifications of Company	20	15	14	19	12	15
2. Personnel	30	20	15	25	15	15
3. Services/References	10	5	4	10	4	8
4. Proposal Requirements	20	13	13	20	15	12
6. Pricing	20	20	9.14	8.99	7.69	6.08
Total Points Scored	100	73	55.14	82.99	53.69	56.08
Ranking		2	5	1	6	34 24

Committee Member: (print name) Dominique Anderson Initials 

Signature:  **Date:** 9/10/24

Summary by:  **Date:** 9/10/24

Note: This form is to be completed by each member of the selection committee.

Committee Member Number: 1

City of Sarasota
MEMBER EVALUATION SCORING SHEET

For
24-51ST, Compensation Study
Number of Scoring Sheets. Sheet 2 of 2

Proposer #6	CBIZ Compensation Consulting
--------------------	-------------------------------------

EVALUATION FACTORS		PROPOSER				
		# 6	# 7	# 8	#9	#10
1. Qualifications of Company	20	20				
2. Personnel	30	15				
3. Services/References	10	8				
4. Proposal Requirements	20	15				
6. Pricing	20	5				
Total Points Scored	100	63				
Ranking		3				

Committee Member: (print name) Dominique Anderson Initials *DA*

Signature:  **Date:** 9/10/24

Summary by:  **Date:** 9/10/24

Note: This form is to be completed by each member of the selection committee.

Committee Member Number: 1

City of Sarasota
MEMBER EVALUATION SCORING SHEET

For
24-51ST, Compensation Study
Number of scoring sheets. Sheet 1 of 2

Proposer #1	Evergreen Solutions, LLC
Proposer #2	Bolton Partners, Inc.
Proposer #3	The Archer Company
Proposer #4	MGT of America Consulting, LLC
Proposer #5	Gallagher Benefit Services, Inc.

EVALUATION FACTORS		PROPOSER				
		# 1	# 2	# 3	# 4	# 5
1. Qualifications of Company	20	20	12	16	10	16
2. Personnel	30	30	25	25	20	20
3. Services/References	10	8	9	10	6	5
4. Proposal Requirements	20	18	16	20	16	12
6. Pricing	20	20	9.14	8.99	7.69	6.08
Total Points Scored	100	96	71.14	79.99	59.69	59.08
Ranking		1	3	2	5	6

Committee Member: (print name) Ben Billingsley Initials BB

Signature:  **Date:** 9/10/24

Summary by:  **Date:** 9/10/24

Note: This form is to be completed by each member of the selection committee.

Committee Member Number: 2

City of Sarasota
MEMBER EVALUATION SCORING SHEET

For
24-51ST, Compensation Study
Number of Scoring Sheets. Sheet 2 of 2

Proposer #6	CBIZ Compensation Consulting
--------------------	-------------------------------------

EVALUATION FACTORS		PROPOSER				
		# 6	# 7	# 8	#9	#10
1. Qualifications of Company	20	12				
2. Personnel	30	25				
3. Services/References	10	5				
4. Proposal Requirements	20	16				
6. Pricing	20	5				
Total Points Scored	100	63				
Ranking		4				

Committee Member: (print name)	Ben Billingsley	Initials	BB
---------------------------------------	-----------------	----------	----

Signature: BB Billingsley **Date:** 9/10/24

Summary by: [Signature] **Date:** 9/10/24

Note: This form is to be completed by each member of the selection committee.

Committee Member Number: 2